

**Assignment #2**

**Conservative vs. Progressive View of Education**

EDTC 807 IMPLEMENTATION AND EVALUATION OF CURRICULUM

Carol A. Munn

New Jersey City University

E.D. Hirsch is an advocate for a “core knowledge base” to be taught in American schools and argues that Progressives such as Dewey are one reason American students are not achieving as well as they should be. Compare his thoughts and ideas to one of his critics.

<p><b>CONCEPTS/IDEA</b>                      “Cultural Literacy” - reading comprehension requires not just formal decoding skills but also background knowledge.</p>	<p><b>HIRSCH ARGUMENT (Conservative)</b>                      “The goal of education is to produce competent actors in society, which requires the acquisition of a corpus of cultural knowledge (facts). In order to decide what to teach, look at what matters in the culture” (Education Death Match: Ed Hirsch Jr vs John Dewey, 2015).</p>	<p><b>DEWEY’S ARGUMENT (Progressive)</b>                      “The goal of education is to fulfill the potential of the learner, which requires building upon the student’s pre-existing competencies. In order to decide what to teach, look at what the student can already do” (Education Death Match: Ed Hirsch Jr vs John Dewey, 2015).</p>
<p><b>Value</b> (Achievement)</p>	<p>Teacher provides factual drills, results in placement, attainment and regurgitation of content by student. Education is driven by content; the amount plus quality furnishes value to the student, equals common core. Subject content emphasizes facts so that students’ developmental conditions include background knowledge. Textbooks convey the national cultural vocabulary, starting early on. Common curriculum ensures the successful teaching of reading and writing through clear repetition, and use of universal symbols. This viewpoint of education is to preserve and communicate past history of society. Similar, a wide and deep basis of knowledge is essential to future academic achievement.</p>	<p>Quality of the student’s experience gives value to the content and allows for positive experiences, leads the student to seek new learning opportunities, achievement and growth. Teacher isn’t central figure in the classroom, actually the facilitator, whereas engaging students in thought provoking conversations to convey content. Teacher can utilize own interests. Content is based on students’ interest, which involves the presentation of real world problems and dealings in everyday life. Also included are the inter-disciplinary subjects, activities and projects to promote democratic and social living. Value of this education is changeable, subjective and/or relative to each student’s needs and personality.</p>
<p><b>Knowledge</b> (Cognitive Learning)</p>	<p>Content given in a common curriculum that ensures all</p>	<p>Knowledge leads to growth and development; a living-</p>

	<p>students possess the same culturally relevant knowledge, regardless of the interests and personal experiences of individual. Teachers’ instill formal tools so students learn more content in the future. Applying those tools, students are more familiar with vocabulary which helps construct meaning in written text. Teacher directs learning, if not, what learned will most likely be short-lived and unshared with society. Student’s role is absorbing factual content deemed appropriate and relevant by teachers. Teachers need to fill students’ brain early otherwise knowledge deficit grows larger, consequentially achievement gap widens throughout society.</p>	<p>learning process with focus on active and interest education. Facilitators inspire a desire for knowledge and serve as guides rather than as taskmasters. School criterion: learn by doing, took on the image of a “lab” structure where all knowledge bestowed is a process in which; the child was the culture (Novack, G. (n.d.). Grounded in real experience, students given the opportunity to engage in situations and problem-solve. Demonstrated knowledge, creativity, engagement, collaboration are essential skills, individual thoughts and the ability to express them. Students’ interest is the driving force and motive for work.</p>
<p><b>Human Nature</b> (Traditions, Changes)</p>	<p>Basic goal of education is acculturation (adopting of cultural traditions, social patterns and values), in that the ideas and information from teachers have to be shared with the children in such a society. Belief that all students need to master the English language in order to valuable contributor and succeed in life. Effective communication using English leads to opportunity, success and income. Teachers instill the belief that hard work is imperative along with commitment to be a societal contributor and that natural talent will only get a person so far in life.</p>	<p>Basic goal of education is active growth process of present experiences and knowledge then applying that knowledge to change and shape society for the future. These education diversities are accumulated and unleashed as creative self-learning; active instruments that enlighten the social and spiritual process of educating a child. Facilitators also encourage physical, mental, social and spiritual skills, which guide the direction of student toward intelligent development. The domineering or central issue is education in democracy and formulating with service to the community and society as a</p>

		whole.
<p><b>Learning</b> (Acquired, Interactive)</p>	<p>Teacher delivers information driven by curriculum filled with historical facts. Experiences of teacher or student aren't considered nor used. Emphasis on cognitive learning where learning is acquired knowledge. Curriculum composed of three R's. Hirsch calls learning "Mental Velcro" (Hart, A. N., n.d.), knowledge attaches to original stored knowledge; leads to expanded factual memory that keeps on growing. Drills and memorization, foundation for curriculum learning. Classroom order and teacher authority are imperative so students learn basic academic knowledge. Hirsch claims, "Children can express individuality only in relation to the traditions of their society, which they have to learn" (Hirsch, E.D., n.d.).</p>	<p>Teacher, facilitator or experiential guide caringly steers students, by understanding needs and abilities, toward experiences, which encourages and leads students to the greatest possible growth in knowledge. Responsiveness, a continuous circle, teacher, students, and curriculum all feeding off each other, allowing for student-driven activities that enhance the subject matter of choice and course of learning. Curriculum includes three R's plus arts, sciences, vocational studies, and life skills. This allows for the actual content to initiate a certain quality of response in students, learning environment can be tweaked and modified in consideration of student experience. Emphasis on the whole child.</p>
<p><b>Transmission</b> (Task-Masters, Guides)</p>	<p>Teacher is the authority on subject matter. Teacher plans activities and supplies knowledge to the student. Dominant figure in class is the teacher, the teacher talks and student sits, listens and absorbs. Lessons are dominated by factual memorization and repetition. Hands-on learning replaced by core, common curriculum that focuses on a specific shared body of knowledge. Instructions given by teachers to students are taught as a</p>	<p>Teacher is the guide for inquiry and modification facilitator. Both, teacher and students plan activities; in which students learn on their own independent of teacher. This learning is hands-on and encourages trial and error and reflection. There are conversations and exchange of ideas between teacher-student. Students initiate a lot of the dialogue, along with discussions and activities. Critical thinking skills are encouraged and help the</p>

	<p>whole class with no differentiation, just skills, drills and memorization. Belief is that if the teacher was to pay specific attention to a single child, then the rest of the students are being neglected.</p>	<p>students to be invested in what is being accomplished. Greater attention is paid to the child's physical needs that encourage more out-of-doors activities. Students should understand past, present and what the future holds.</p>
<p><b>Society</b> (Facts, Individualism)</p>	<p>Knowledge of cultural traditions and practices that are valued, plus the connection to society, and recognized by others as equal, contributing members. Students with disabilities often segregated physically and by curriculum content. This serves as stigma from outside the mainstream population and teachers set low expectations. In turn, might dilute the curriculum, and not provide all of the important knowledge needed to develop academically and socially. Emphasis on group values, acceptance of norms and roles in society; nothing can be done about inequalities, social class difference, importance of society; individual restricted by customs and traditions of society; everyone must conform.</p>	<p>Emphasis on individual growth and development; individual potential to learn apply that learning and abilities to reconstruct and make valuable societal contributions. Self-realization enables student to develop to one's own full potential. Free education for all from K to higher institutions. Students would themselves carry on the educational process, aided and guided by the teacher. Union between school and home to include areas of music, dancing, play and other extra-curricular activities. Important skills are cooperation, sharing and caring for one another. Now as well-adjusted citizens, society would flourish and strengthen democratic order of free and equal citizens.</p>
<p><b>Opportunity</b> (Influences)</p>	<p>Common ground between Hirsch and Dewey is that the experience results from what has been done and conveyed from previous human activities. There needs to be a balance between the acquired information and the ability to learn from it. Excellence in education, as far as human potential permits,</p>	<p>Common ground between Hirsch and Dewey is that the experience results from what has been done and conveyed from previous human activities. In the area of experience, it does not occur in a vacuum nor does it reside in the individual alone. Experience is continuously coming in from external</p>

	<p>academic rewards and jobs based on merit. Students are groomed by the teacher’s teaching for a lifetime of working in what jobs society is in need of at the time. In addition, equality in education is “only a well-rounded, knowledge-specific curriculum can impart needed knowledge to all children and overcome inequality of opportunity” (Hirsch, n.d.).</p>	<p>sources and facilitators. Encouragement by facilitators (teachers) to reach beyond the classroom walls is highly justifiable and acceptable. Equality in education, education permits more than just one chance and more than an equal chance to disadvantaged groups.</p>
<p><b>Consensus</b> (Political views of education)</p>	<p>Teachers group the students homogeneously and by ability. Students are to conform and comply with the authority figure and then accept what the outcome that is set forth. Cognitive and moral development leads to good citizenship. Knowledge and discipline prepare students for freedom. Hirsch makes education and culture the driving force and everyone must adjust to one central dominant culture. Also, with politics being part of the system, Republicans usually side with the way this education system is administered, for teacher-driven classes and students are feed information.</p>	<p>Facilitators group students heterogeneously with the distribution and integration of students. Emphasis on creativity, nonconformity, and self-actualization; direct experiences in democratic living and political/social action prepare students for freedom. Cooperation and connections between school, facilitators, and home life motivate and fill all needs of the child’s development such as music, dancing, play and other extra-curricular activities. Politically speaking, democratic view of education is student driven, critical thinking, problem solving, product struggle (allowing for flexible thinking), teacher as a facilitator, and education for all.</p>

### References

- Becoming a Better University Teacher. (n.d.). Retrieved March 10, 2018, from [http://www.ucdoer.ie/index.php/Education\\_Theory/Constructivism\\_and\\_Social\\_Constructivism](http://www.ucdoer.ie/index.php/Education_Theory/Constructivism_and_Social_Constructivism)
- Dewey vs. Hirsch: Winner and Loser or Draw? (October, 2016). Retrieved March 07, 2018, from <https://educatndog.wordpress.com/2016/10/26/edu-cat-and-dog/>
- Education death match: Ed Hirsch Jr vs John Dewey. (2015, September 28). Retrieved March 07, 2018, from <https://englishcorridor.wordpress.com/education-death-match-ed-hirsch-jr-vs-john-dewey/>
- Giddings, L. R. (1998). Beyond E.D. Hirsch and Cultural Literacy: Thinking Skills for Cultural Awareness. *Community Review*, 16109.
- Hart, A. N. (n.d.). Retrieved March 10, 2018, from <http://www.newfoundations.com/GALLERY/Hirsch.html>
- Hirsch, Jr., E. D. (n.d.). Retrieved March 08, 2018, from <https://www.coreknowledge.org/about-us/e-d-hirsch-jr/>
- Novack, G. (n.d.). Retrieved March 09, 2018, from <https://www.marxists.org/archive/novack/works/1960/x03.htm>
- Ornstein, A, Pajak, E, and Pajak, S. (2015) *Contemporary issues in curriculum*, 6<sup>th</sup> Edition. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson.
- Scott, P. (1988). Review: A few words more about E. D. hirsch and cultural literacy. *College English*, 50(3), 333. Retrieved from <https://draweb.njcu.edu:2055/docview/236914431?accountid=12793>
- What We Can Learn from Core Knowledge and E.D. Hirsch? (February, 2013). Retrieved

March 08, 2018, from <https://pragmaticreform.wordpress.com/2013/01/19/hirsch/>